

## Determination in accordance with Article. 18.8(2) of the United States-Colombia Trade Promotion Agreement

**Submitter:** Iván Salazar Penna

Party: Colombia

Submission ID: USCOLSALASEEM/COL/01/2023

**Date of the submission:** June 28, 2023

**Date of the determination:** September 18, 2023

#### 1. Introduction

The United States of America (hereinafter referred to as "U.S." or the "United States") and Colombia (hereinafter collectively referred to as the "Parties" and individually to as the "Party"), signed on November 22nd, 2006, the Trade Promotion Agreement (hereinafter referred to as "TPA") and on June 28th, 2007, signed an Amending Protocol to the same Agreement. Once the internal procedures for its ratification were completed and the implementation phase was finalized, the TPA came into force on May 15, 2012.

The U.S.-Colombia TPA included a chapter on the environment (hereinafter "Chapter Eighteen"). In particular, Article 18.8 of that TPA established a mechanism for filing submissions on environmental enforcement matters, by virtue of which, any person may file a submission asserting that a Party is failing to effectively enforce its environmental laws. Furthermore, said article provided that the Parties shall designate a Secretariat or other appropriate body to which submission on environmental enforcement matters will be filed. Likewise, Article 18.9 of the TPA sets out the preparation and development of factual records by the Secretariat, if any member of the Environmental Affairs Council<sup>1</sup> established under Articles 18.6.1 of the TPA<sup>2</sup>, instructs it to do so.

The Parties through an Agreement of July 2018, established the Secretariat for Environmental Enforcement Matter (hereinafter referred to as the "Secretariat") and designated it to carry out the functions prescribed for the Secretariat in articles 18.8 and 18.9 of the TPA.

## 2. Background

On June 28, 2023, Iván Salazar Penna, a citizen of Colombia named filed a submission on environmental enforcement matters via electronic mail under Article 18.8 of the TPA, in

<sup>1</sup> In accordance with article 18.6.1 of the TPA, each Party shall designate "a senior level official with environmental responsibilities to represent it on the Council and an office in its appropriate ministry or government entity to serve as its contact point for carrying out the work of the Council".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Agreement establishing a Secretariat for Environmental Enforcement Matters under the United States-Colombia Trade Promotion Agreement.



which he asserts that the Colombian Government is failing to effectively enforce its environmental laws regarding the Civil Society Nature Reserve El Danubio.

After registering the submission as "Reserva Natural de la Sociedad Civil (RNSC) – El Danubio" and assigning it the filing number USCOLSALASEEM/COL/01/2023, the Secretariat acknowledged receipt via email on July 18, 2023 with communication number USCOLSALASEEM/COL/01/2023-S1Esp.

In accordance with the submission on environmental enforcement matters process established in Articles 18.8 and 18.9 of the TPA, the Secretariat must proceed to determine whether the submission filed meets the requirements of Article 18.8(2) of the TPA. Before reviewing if the submission meets eligibility requirements, a brief summary of the submission filed is provided.

## 3. Summary of the submission

According to the Submitter, the Colombian Government is failing to effectively enforce its environmental laws regarding the Civil Society Nature Reserve ("RNSC" by its Spanish acronym or the "Reserve") El Danubio located in the village of Caldas in the municipality of Morelia, Department of Caquetá. The National Natural Parks Agency registered this RSNC by Resolution 008 of February 14, 2020 for the property called "El Danubio", Identified with real estate registration folio numbered 420-26142.

The submitter, as the owner of the RSNC El Danubio, asserts that the Government of Colombia is failing to effectively enforce Article 11 of Decree 1996 of 1999 due to the lack of notice of the works under the Solidarity Agreement No. 026-CNVS-2022 dated November 17, 2022, entered into the municipality of Morelia and the Community Action Committee (Junta de Acción Comunal) of the Caldas village, related to the adaptation of the sanitation facilities at the Palmarito educational institution. The submitter states that the educational institution is located within the RNSC El Danubio, and its status as a protected area and higher environmental criteria for land use planning (determinante ambiental), were not taken into account. The submitter also expresses his concern about possible environmental impacts due to the passage of people and, motorcycles, as well as the effect this is having on species that he has been protecting and conserving, and its strategic importance in the birth of water sources, which feed the Morelia aqueduct.

Additionally, the submitter alleges that with the project "construction of aqueduct network and drinking water treatment plant for the urban area of the municipality of Morelia", the Colombian government is failing to effectively enforce Article 11 of Decree 1996 of 1999, regarding the rights of holders of the RSNCs, as the holders of the El Danubio Reserve were not notified or consulted.

Likewise, the submitter raises his objections due to the lack of feasibility of the water concession permit for the continuation of the previous project, as well as its impact on the



MURUI-YU-PAHUER indigenous community and deficiencies in the technical studies. The submitter also mentions that he has reported the logging of forest species within the RSNC El Danubio.

As a result of the complaints made to various authorities, the submitter expresses allegations of pressure and persecution.

### 4. Review of the submission requirements

In accordance with Article 18.8(2) of the TPA, the Secretariat may consider a submission, if it finds that the submission meets with the eligibility requirements established in letters a) to f) of the aforementioned article, which are elaborated upon below.

### a. It is filed in writing in English or Spanish.

The submission, as well as the additional documentation, which is provided by the submitter, is written in Spanish. Therefore, the Secretariat finds that the submission meets the requirement established in letter a) of Article 18.8(2) of the TPA.

### b. It clearly identifies the person making the submission

The submission includes the name, identity document, address, email address, and contact number of the submitter. This information is sufficient for identifying and communicating with the submitter. As a result, the Secretariat finds that the submission complies with the requirement in letter b) of the article 18.8(2) of the TPA.

# c. (i) It provides sufficient information to allow the Secretariat to review the submission, including documentary evidence on which the submission is based

In addition to the written submission, the submitter provided supporting documentation that allows the Secretariat to review the submission. Therefore, this Secretariat finds that the submission meets with the first part of the eligibility requirement set forth in in letter c) of article 18.8(2) of the TPA

## c. (ii) Identification of the environmental laws of which failure to enforce is asserted

Article 18.14 of the TPA defines the term environmental law as follows:

- **[E] nvironmental law** means any statute or regulation of a Party, or provision thereof, the primary purpose of which is the protection of the environment, or the prevention of a danger to human, animal, or plant life or health, through:
- a) the prevention, abatement, or control of the release, discharge, or emission of pollutants or environmental contaminants;
- b) the control of environmentally hazardous or toxic chemicals, substances, materials, and wastes, and the dissemination of information related thereto; or



c) the protection or conservation of wild flora or fauna, including endangered species, their habitat, and specially protected natural areas.<sup>11</sup>

in areas with respect to which a Party exercises sovereignty, sovereign rights, or jurisdiction, but does not include any statute or regulation, or provision thereof, directly related to worker safety or health.

<sup>11</sup> The Parties recognize that such protection or conservation may include the protection or conservation of biological diversity.

Furthermore, Article 24.1 also defines a statute or regulation:

For Colombia, **statute or regulation** means a law of Congress or Decree or Resolution promulgated by the central level of government to implement a law of Congress that is enforceable by action of the central level of government.

Based on the previous definitions, the Secretariat proceeds to indicate the laws and regulations identified by the submitter and to state the reasons regarding the eligibility of the legal provisions cited by the submitter.

Firstly, the submitter indicates in their submission that he had not been "notified and informed about the work to be carried out within the El Danubio Nature Reserve" under the Solidarity Agreement entered into the municipality of Morelia and the Caldas Community Action Committee, related to the adaptation of the sanitation facilities of the Palmarito Educational Institution. Indicating that "any internal process should be consulted with its landowners as established by Decree 1996 of 1999".

Additionally, in the project entitled "construction of the aqueduct network and drinking water treatment plant for the urban area of the municipality of Morelia," the submitter alleges that the provisions of Article 11 of Decree 1996 of 1999 have not been taken into account. Rights. "Duly registered landowners of Civil Society Nature Reserves...". This is since "landowners have not been contacted despite being environmental criteria in the 30m buffer zone around the boundary of the water source that forms part of the El Danubio Nature Reserve."

Article 11 of Decree 1996 of 1999 states:

Article 11.- Rights. Duly registered landowners of Civil Society Nature Reserves may exercise the following rights:

- 1. Right to participate in the planning processes of development programs.
- 2. Right to give or withhold consent prior to the execution of public investments that affect them.
- 3. Right to incentives.
- 4. Any other participation rights established by law.



This Secretariat notes that Decree 1996 of 1999 was compiled by Decree 1076 of 2015, corresponding to the Single Regulatory Decree of the Environment and Sustainable Development Sector, which, as will be indicated below, was identified by the submitter as one of the laws of which the failure to enforce is asserted. In this respect, Article 11 of Decree 1996 of 1999 corresponds to Article 2.2.2.2.1.17.11. of Decree 1076 of 2015 as a current regulation.

This Secretariat finds that Article 2.2.2.1.17.11. of Decree 1076 of 2015 qualify as environmental law under Article 18.14 of the TPA, since its primary purpose is the protection or conservation of the environment specially protected natural areas such as the Civil Society Nature Reserves.

In addition to the previous regulatory provision, the submitter identified additional statutes and regulations. The submitter provided a list and classification of these provisions, which cited below, along with the Secretariat's review:

LEGAL PROVISIONS CITED	SECRETARIAT'S REVIEW
GENERAL LAWS:	
Colombian Political Constitution of 1991	The submitter does not specify any provisions that fall under Article 18.14 of the TPA as environmental law.
Law 99 of 1993 and its regulatory decrees. Whereby the Ministry of the Environment is created, the public sector responsible for managing and conserving the environment and renewable natural resources is reorganized, the National Environmental System (SINA) is structured, and other provisions are enacted.	Although Law 99 of 1993 could be qualified as environmental law, the submitter does not specify any particular provisions that the Colombian Government is failing to enforce effectively.
	Likewise, the submitter does not specify the decrees and particular provisions that the Colombian Government is failing to enforce effectively and that could be qualified as environmental law under the terms of Article 18.14 of the TPA.
Law 388 of 1997 (land-use planning) and is regulatory decrees	The submitter does not specify any provisions that fall under Article 18.14 of the TPA as environmental law.
Decree 2844 of 2010. Whereby organic regulations regarding budgets and the National Development Plan are established.	The submitter does not specify any provisions that fall under Article 18.14 of the TPA as environmental law.
Law 1454 of 2011 and its legislative decrees. Whereby organic regulations regarding land-use planning are enacted and other provisions are modified.	The submitter does not specify any provisions that fall under Article 18.14 of the TPA as environmental law.
	Likewise, the submitter does not specify the decrees and particular provisions that the Colombian Government is failing to enforce



LEGAL PROVISIONS CITED	SECRETARIAT'S REVIEW
	effectively and that could be qualified
	as environmental law under the terms
	of Article 18.14 of the TPA.
Law 1712 of 2014 and its legislative decrees.	Although the submitter does not
Whereby the law of transparency and the right	specify particular provisions of Law
to access national public information are	1454 of 2011 and its regulatory decrees
created and other provisions are enacted.	that can be qualified as environmental
	legislation under the terms of Article
	18.14 of the TPA, transparency and the
	right of access to environmental information contribute to the effective
	enforcement of environmental laws
	and could be considered in the
	enforcement review as applicable.
Decree 1072 of 2015. Whereby the Single	The submitter does not specify the
Regulatory Decreefor the labor sector is issued.	particular provisions that the
	Colombian Government is failing to
	enforce effectively and that could be
	qualified as environmental law under
	the terms of Article 18.14 of the TPA.
	In addition, according to the Article
	18.14 of the TPA, the definition of
	environmental legislation does not
	include any statute or regulation, or
	provision thereof, directly related to
	workers' safety or health.
Decree 1076 of 2015. Whereby the Single	Given the general reference to Decree
Regulatory Decreefor the environmental and	1076 of 2015 and the above reference,
sustainable development sector is issued.	Article 2.2.2.1.17.11 of Decree 1076 of
	2015 will be qualified as environmental
	law that the Colombian Government is failing to enforce effectively.
Decree 1077 of 2015. Whereby the Single	The submitter does not specify any
Regulatory Decreefor the housing, city and	provisions that fall under Article 18.14
territory sector is issued.	of the TPA as environmental law.
Resolution 0312 of 2019. Whereby the minimum	According to the Article 18.14 of the
standards of the Workplace Health and Safety	TPA, the definition of environmental
Management System are defined.	legislation does not include any statute
	or regulation, or provision thereof,
	directly related to workers' safety or
	health.
Colombian Technical Standard NTC-ISO 10005 -	Technical standards do not have the
Quality Control Systems / Directives for Quality	force of law or regulations unless
Control Plans.  DISASTER RISK MANAG	incorporated within them.
Decree 2340 of 1997: Whereby measures for	The submitter does not specify any
organizing the prevention and mitigation of	provisions that fall under Article 18.14
forest fires and other provisions are enacted.	of the TPA as environmental law.



LEGAL PROVISIONS CITED	SECRETARIAT'S REVIEW	
	This law is not in force, as it was	
Law 46 of 1988. Whereby the National System for Disaster Prevention and Response is created and structured, extraordinary powers are	repealed by Article 96 of Law 1523 of 2012.	
granted to the president of Colombia, and other provisions are enacted.		
Document CONPES 3146 of 2001. Strategy to consolidate the implementation of the National Plan for Disaster Prevention and Response (PNPAD by its Spanish acronym) in the short and	Since this is a public policy document, it could not be qualified as environmental law under the terms of Article 18.14 of the TPA.	
medium term.		
Decree 510 of 2011. Whereby directives for the formulation of the Action Plan for Responding to the Emergency and Mitigating its Effects are adopted.	The submitter does not specify any provisions that fall under Article 18.14 of the TPA as environmental law.	
Law 1523 of 2012. Whereby the national disaster risk management policy is adopted, the National Disaster Risk Management System is established, and other provisions are enacted.	The submitter does not specify any provisions that fall under Article 18.14 of the TPA as environmental law.	
Resolution 154 of 2014. Whereby the guidelines for the formulation of emergency and contingency plans for the management of disasters and emergencies related to the provision of public domestic water, sewage and trash collection services, and other provisions are enacted.	The submitter does not specify any provisions that fall under Article 18.14 of the TPA as environmental law.	
Decree 1807 of 2014. Whereby Article 189 of Decree-Law 019 of 2012 is regulated in what pertains to the integration of risk management into land use plans, and other provisions are enacted.	This regulation was compiled in Decree 1077 of 2015 (see comment above).	
STRUCTURAL AND GEOTI	ECHNICAL LAWS:	
Decree 1400 of 1984. Whereby the Colombian Earthquake-Resistant Construction Code is adopted.	This decree is not in force, as it was repealed by Article 55 of Law 400 of 1997.	
Law 400 of 1997. Whereby standards regarding earthquake-resistant construction are adopted.	The submitter does not specify any provisions that fall under Article 18.14 of the TPA as environmental law.	
Decree 926 of 2010 - Colombian Earthquake- Resistant Construction Regulations NSR-10. Ministry of the Environment, Housing and Territorial Development.	The submitter does not specify any provisions that fall under Article 18.14 of the TPA as environmental law.	
Decree 945 of 2017. Whereby Decree 926 of March 19, 2010 is modified and other provision are enacted. Ministry of Housing, City and Territory.	See above comment regarding Decree 926 of 2010.	
ENVIRONMENTAL LAWS		
Law 2 of 1959. Concerning the forest economy of the nation and the conservation of renewable natural resources.	The submitter does not specify any provisions that fall under Article 18.14 of the TPA as environmental law.	



LEGAL PROVISIONS CITED	SECRETARIAT'S REVIEW
Resolution 1433 of 2004. Whereby Article 12 of	The submitter does not specify any
Decree 3100 of 2003 is regulated with regard to	provisions that fall under Article 18.14
sanitation and discharge management plans,	of the TPA as environmental law.
and other determinations are adopted.	
Resolution 2145 of 2005. Whereby Resolution	See above comment regarding
1433 of 2004 regarding sanitation and discharge	Resolution 1433 of 2004.
management plans is partially modified.	1.000141.0111100 01 200 11
Resolution 1285 of 2006. Whereby the terms of	The submitter does not specify any
reference are adopted regarding the production	provisions that fall under Article 18.14
of environmental impact studies for the	of the TPA as environmental law.
construction and operation of domestic	or the free designation of the tark.
wastewater treatment plants, and other	
determinations are adopted.	
Resolution 1503 of 2010. Whereby the general	This resolution is not in force, as it was
methodology for the presentation of	repealed by Article 6 of Resolution
environmental studies is adopted.	1402 of 2018.
Decree 3930 of 2010. Whereby Heading I of Law	This decree was compiled in Decree
9a of 1979 and Chapter II of Heading VI, Part III	1076 of 2015. See comment above
of Decree-Law 2811 of 1974 are partially	regarding Decree 1076 of 2015.
regulated with regard to water uses and liquid	regarding Decree 1010 of 2010.
waste, and other provisions are enacted.	
Decree 1640 of 2012. Whereby instruments for	This decree was compiled in Decree
the planning, organization and management of	1076 of 2015. See above comment
hydrographic basins and aquifers are regulated,	regarding Decree 1076 of 2015.
and other provisions are enacted.	regarding becree 1010 of 2010.
Resolution 1541 of 2013. Whereby permissible air	The submitter does not specify any
quality and immission levels are established, the	provisions that fall under Article 18.14
procedure for evaluating activities that generate	of the TPA as environmental law.
offensive odors is defined, and other provisions	or the TTA as environmental taw.
are enacted.	
Decree 1287 of 2014. Whereby criteria for the use	This decree was compiled in Decree
of biosolids generated in municipal wastewater	1077 of 2015. See above comment
treatment plants are established.	regarding Decree 1077 of 2015.
Resolution 631 of 2015. Whereby the parameters	The submitter does not specify any
and maximum permissible limits for one-time	provisions that fall under Article 18.14
discharging into surface water bodies and public	of the TPA as environmental law.
sewage systems are established, and other	or the TTA as environmental taw.
provisions are enacted.	
Decree 1076 of 2015, Single Regulatory Decreeof	See above comment regarding Decree
the environmental and sustainable development	1076 of 2015.
sector.	1070 01 2010.
Resolution 472 of 2017. Whereby the	The submitter does not specify any
comprehensive management of the waste	provisions that fall under Article 18.14
generated in construction and demolition	of the TPA as environmental law.
activities is regulated, and other provisions are	or the first as environmental taw.
enacted.	
Decree 050 of 2018. Whereby Decree 1076 of	This decree was compiled in Decree
2015 (Single Regulatory Decreeof the	1076 of 2015. See above comment
environmental and sustainable development	
	regarding Decree 1076 of 2015.
sector) is partially modified with regard to the	



LEGAL PROVISIONS CITED	SECRETARIAT'S REVIEW
regional environmental microbasin councils	
(CARMACs) and the regulation of water	
resources and discharges, and other provisions	
are enacted.	
DRINKING WATER AND BASIC	SANITATION LAWS
Resolution 330 of 2017. Whereby technical	The submitter does not specify any
regulations for the drinking water and basic	provisions that fall under Article 18.14
sanitation sector are adopted, and Resolutions	of the TPA as environmental law.
1096 of 2000, 0424 of 2001, 0668 of 2003, 1459	
of 2005, 1447 of 2005 and 2320 of 2009 are	
repealed.	
Resolution 650 of 2017. Whereby a temporary	See above comment regarding Decree
article is added to Resolution 330 of 2017.	650 of 2017.
Resolution 501 of 2017. Whereby technical	The submitter does not specify any
requirements related to chemical composition	provisions that fall under Article 18.14
and information are issued, which must be met	of the TPA as environmental law.
by any tubes, ducts and accessories for use in	
water main, sewage, sanitary and rainwater	
systems and domestic hydro-sanitary	
installations that may be acquired by people	
who provide water and sewage services, and	
Resolutions 1166 of 2006 and 1127 of 2007 are	
repealed.	
Resolution 115 of 2018. Whereby Article 19 of	See above comment regarding
Resolution 0501 of 2017 is modified, whereby	Resolution 0501 of 2017.
technical requirements related to chemical	
composition and information are issued, which	
must be met by any tubes, ducts and	
accessories for use in water main, sewage,	
sanitary and rainwater systems and domestic	
hydro-sanitary installations that may be	
acquired by people who provide water and	
sewage services, and Resolutions 1166 of 2006	
and 1127 of 2007 are repealed.	
Resolution 884 of 2018. Whereby technical	
requirements for water and basic sanitation	provisions that fall under Article 18.14
projects in rural areas that are carried out under	of the TPA as environmental law.
the differential schemes defined in Part 3,	
Heading 7, Chapter 1 of Book 2 of Decree 1077 of	
2015 are established.	This possibility is not in force as 9
Resolution 1063 of 2016. Whereby requirements	This resolution is not in force, as it was
for water and basic sanitation projects in rural	repealed by Article 28 of Resolution
areas that are carried out under the differential	661 of 2019.
schemes defined in Part 3, Heading 7, Chapter 1 of Book 2 of Decree 1077 of 2015 are established.	
ETHNIC AND PLANN	INC LAWS:
Because they are rights that have been	The submitter does not specify any
established by constitutional law and due to it	provisions that fall under Article 18.14 of the TPA as environmental law.
being supported by the environmental authority itself.	or the TPA as environmental law.
ilseii.	



LEGAL PROVISIONS CITED	SECRETARIAT'S REVIEW
As planning and land-use tools, but despite this there is pressure and none of the planning principles are followed at local, departmental and national level.	
This generates pressure on those of us who are dedicated to conservation and protection based on the Constitution and the law, leading to fatigue and persecution.	

The Secretariat finds that with the submitter's identification of article 2.2.2.1.17.11. of Decree 1076 of 2015, as environmental law of which the failure to enforce is asserted, the submission fulfills the second part of the admissibility set out in letter (c) of Article 18.8 (2).

### d. Appears to be aimed at promoting enforcement rather than at harassing industry;

The submission filed does not appear to be aimed at harassing an industry, but at seeking the effective enforcement of the environmental law. Therefore, the Secretariat finds that the submission meets the requirement established in letter d) of Article 18.8(2) of the TPA.

# e. Indicates that the matter has been communicated in writing to the relevant authorities of the Party and indicates the Party's response, if any

The submitter includes documentation by which it is evident that the matter has been communicated in writing to the following relevant authorities: Corpoamazonía; the Ministry of Environment and Sustainable Development; the Ministry of Housing, City and Territory; the Mayor's Office, Police Inspection and Office of the Ombudsman of Morelia; the Governor's Office of Caquetá; the Office of the Comptroller General of the Republic; Office of the Inspector General of Colombia; and Office of the Attorney General of Colombia. The communications sent by the submitter to the authorities and the responses provided by the authorities, which are attached to the submission, are listed in the analysis of the first part of the eligibility requirement set out in letter c) of Article 18.8(2) of the TPA.

The Secretariat finds that the submission fulfills the requirement of letter e) of Article 18.8 (2) of the TPA, since it includes information substantiating that the matter has been communicated in writing to the relevant authorities of the Party.

## f. Filed by a person of a Party.

Article 18.8(1) of the TPA allows any person of a Party to file a submission asserting that a Party is failing to effectively enforce its environmental laws. In this regard, Chapter One of the TPA<sup>3</sup> defines the term "person of a Party" as "a national or an enterprise of a Party".

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Initial Provisions and General Definitions.



Likewise, it defines "national" as "a natural person who has the nationality of a Party<sup>4</sup> according to Annex 1.3 or a permanent resident of a Part".

In the submission filed, the submitter identifies himself as a Colombian citizen, fulfilling the requirement of letter f) of Article 18.8(2) of the TPA, since he is a natural person who has the nationality of a Party.

#### 5. Determination of the Secretariat

For the foregoing reasons. the Secretariat finds that submission USCOLSALASEEM/COL/01/2023 meets the eligibility requirements of article 18.8 (2) of the TPA. Pursuant to Article 18.8(4) of the TPA, the Secretariat will determine whether the submission merits a response from the Party.

Notice is hereby given to the submitter and to the Environmental Affairs Council for the purposes established in Chapter Eighteen of the TPA.

(Original signed)

David Marín Cortés Executive Director

### Secretariat for Environmental Enforcement Matters

U.S. - COLOMBIA TRADE PROMOTION AGREEMENT

C.C. Sarah Flores, Department of State - U.S. Sigrid Simpson, Office of the U.S. Trade Representative Daniela Almario, Ministry of Environment and Sustainable Development - Colombia. Laura Constanza Hernández, Ministry of Commerce, Industry and Tourism Colombia Submitter

the Constitución Política de Colombia.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> According to Annex 1.3 of the TPA regarding Country-Specific Definitions, with respect to Colombia, natural person who has the nationality of a Party means Colombians by birth or naturalization, in accordance with Article 96 of